

El Research report

Laboratory testing of electronic bulk water detectors for aviation fuelling

EI RESEARCH REPORT

LABORATORY TESTING OF ELECTRONIC BULK WATER DETECTORS FOR AVIATION FUELLING

P. Rugen¹, J. Dunbar², K. Petersen³ and M. S. D. Hunnybun⁴

1 Shell Global Solutions, Shell Technology Center Houston, 3333 Hwy 6 South, Houston Texas 77082-3101, USA

2 Formerly Shell Global Solutions, Shell Technology Centre Thornton

3 Southwest Research Institute, 6220 Culebra Road, Post Office Drawer 28510, San Antonio, Texas 78228-0510, USA

4 Energy Institute, 61 New Cavendish Street, London, W1G 7AR, UK

Published by

ENERGY INSTITUTE, LONDON

The Energy Institute is a professional membership body incorporated by Royal Charter 2003

Registered charity number 1097899

The Energy Institute (EI) is the chartered professional membership body for the energy industry, supporting over 20 000 individuals working in or studying energy and 250 energy companies worldwide. The EI provides learning and networking opportunities to support professional development, as well as professional recognition and technical and scientific knowledge resources on energy in all its forms and applications.

The EI's purpose is to develop and disseminate knowledge, skills and good practice towards a safe, secure and sustainable energy system. In fulfilling this mission, the EI addresses the depth and breadth of the energy sector, from fuels and fuels distribution to health and safety, sustainability and the environment. It also informs policy by providing a platform for debate and scientifically-sound information on energy issues.

The EI is licensed by:

- the Engineering Council to award Chartered, Incorporated and Engineering Technician status;
- the Science Council to award Chartered Scientist status, and
- the Society for the Environment to award Chartered Environmentalist status.

It also offers its own Chartered Energy Engineer, Chartered Petroleum Engineer and Chartered Energy Manager titles.

A registered charity, the EI serves society with independence, professionalism and a wealth of expertise in all energy matters.

This publication has been produced as a result of work carried out within the Technical Team of the EI, funded by the EI's Technical Partners. The EI's Technical Work Programme provides industry with cost-effective, value-adding knowledge on key current and future issues affecting those operating in the energy sector, both in the UK and internationally.

For further information, please visit <http://www.energyinst.org>

The EI gratefully acknowledges the financial contributions towards the scientific and technical programme from the following companies

BG Group	RWE npower
BP Exploration Operating Co Ltd	Saudi Aramco
BP Oil UK Ltd	Scottish Power
Centrica	SGS
Chevron	Shell UK Oil Products Limited
CLH	Shell U.K. Exploration and Production Ltd
ConocoPhillips Ltd	SSE
Dana Petroleum	Statkraft
DONG Energy	Statoil
EDF Energy	Talisman Sinopec Energy UK Ltd
ENI	Total E&P UK Limited
E.ON UK	Total UK Limited
ExxonMobil International Ltd	Tullow
International Power	Valero
Kuwait Petroleum International Ltd	Vattenfall
Maersk Oil North Sea UK Limited	Vitol
Nexen	World Fuel Services
Phillips 66	

However, it should be noted that the above organisations have not all been directly involved in the development of this publication, nor do they necessarily endorse its content.

Copyright © 2015 by the Energy Institute, London.

The Energy Institute is a professional membership body incorporated by Royal Charter 2003.

Registered charity number 1097899, England

All rights reserved

No part of this book may be reproduced by any means, or transmitted or translated into a machine language without the written permission of the publisher.

ISBN 978 0 85293 748 8

Published by the Energy Institute

The information contained in this publication is provided for general information purposes only. Whilst the Energy Institute and the contributors have applied reasonable care in developing this publication, no representations or warranties, express or implied, are made by the Energy Institute or any of the contributors concerning the applicability, suitability, accuracy or completeness of the information contained herein and the Energy Institute and the contributors accept no responsibility whatsoever for the use of this information. Neither the Energy Institute nor any of the contributors shall be liable in any way for any liability, loss, cost or damage incurred as a result of the receipt or use of the information contained herein.

Electronic access to EI and IP publications is available via our website, <https://publishing.energyinst.org>.

Documents can be purchased online as downloadable pdfs or on an annual subscription for single users and companies.

For more information, contact the EI Publications Team.

e: pubs@energyinst.org

CONTENTS

	Page
Legal notices and disclaimers	6
Foreword	7
Acknowledgements	8
Executive summary	9
1 Introduction, objectives and scope	11
1.1 Introduction	11
1.2 Objectives	11
1.3 Scope	12
2 Bench-scale assessment of a range of bulk water detectors by Shell Global Solutions	13
2.1 Introduction	13
2.2 Bulk water detector literature review/selection	13
2.3 Bench-scale test set-up	14
2.4 Bench-scale test results	16
2.5 Discussion/observations of bench-scale test results	16
3 Laboratory test rig assessment of candidate bulk water detectors by Shell Global Solutions	19
3.1 Introduction	19
3.2 Bulk water detector selection	19
3.3 Experimental	19
3.4 Laboratory test rig results	21
4 Laboratory test rig assessment of candidate bulk water detectors by Southwest Research Institute	22
4.1 Background	22
4.2 Sensors and candidate detectors	22
4.3 Test procedure	24
4.4 Test variables	25
4.5 Baseline requirements	26
4.6 Standard water challenge	26
4.7 Water slug challenge	27
4.8 Results and discussion	28
5 Conclusions	34
6 Recommendations	35

Contents continued	Page
Annexes	
Annex A SwRI Laboratory test rig data for sensor A	36
Annex B SwRI Laboratory test rig data for sensor B	61
Annex C SwRI Laboratory test rig data for sensor C	86
Annex D SwRI Laboratory test rig data for sensor D	111
Annex E SwRI Laboratory test rig data for candidate detector E	136
Annex F SwRI Laboratory test rig data for candidate detector F	161
Annex G SwRI Laboratory test rig data for candidate detector G	186
Annex H SwRI Laboratory test rig data for candidate detector H	211
Annex I SwRI Laboratory test rig data for candidate detector I	236
Annex J SwRI Laboratory test rig data for candidate detector J	261
Annex K SwRI Laboratory test rig data for candidate detector K	286
Annex L SwRI Laboratory test rig baseline and supporting test data	311

LIST OF FIGURES AND TABLES

FIGURES

Figure 1:	High speed shear mixer used to blend Jet A-1/tap water solutions	15
Figure 2:	Control unit and lights to activate in response to signal output	15
Figure 3:	Peristaltic pump used to flow test fluids through detector W	15
Figure 4:	Installation of detector V in the test rig	19
Figure 5:	Installation of detector W in the test rig.	20
Figure 6:	LED sensor box and voltage response data on computer	23
Figure 7:	Test rig for bulk water detector testing	24
Figure 8:	Overview of test facility	24
Figure 9:	Water injection point (prior to pumps).	25

TABLES

Table 1:	Details of the five detectors chosen for bench-scale testing	13
Table 2:	Responses of the five detectors to each of the test conditions	17
Table 3:	Response time and subsequent signal clear time of the five detectors to each of the test conditions	18
Table 4:	Responses of the two detectors to each test rig condition	21
Table 5:	Response times for detector W to each test rig condition.	21
Table 6:	Sensor descriptions	22
Table 7:	Flow velocity and volume flow testing parameters	26
Table 8:	Testing matrix for both fuel types.	27
Table 9:	Summary of test results for flow velocity: 1 m/s	30
Table 10:	Summary of test results for flow velocity: 3 m/s	31
Table 11:	Summary of test results for flow velocity: 5 m/s	32
Table 12:	Summary of test results for flow velocity: 7 m/s	33
Table A.1:	Sensor A water trigger range.	38
Table B.1:	Sensor B water trigger range	63
Table C.1:	Sensor C water trigger range.	88
Table D.1:	Sensor D water trigger range.	113
Table E.1:	Candidate detector E water trigger range	138
Table F.1:	Candidate detector F water trigger range	163
Table G.1:	Candidate detector G water trigger range	188
Table H.1:	Candidate detector H water trigger range	213
Table I.1:	Candidate detector I water trigger range	238
Table J.1:	Candidate detector J water trigger range.	263
Table K.1:	Candidate detector K water trigger range	288
Table L.1:	Supporting baseline and test data for 32 GPM (1 m/s)	311
Table L.2:	Supporting baseline and test data for 96 GPM (3 m/s)	313
Table L.3:	Supporting baseline and test data for 161 GPM (5 m/s)	314
Table L.4:	Supporting baseline and test data for 225 GPM (7 m/s)	315

LEGAL NOTICES AND DISCLAIMERS

This publication has been prepared by the EI Aviation Committee.

The information contained in this publication is provided as guidance only, and although every effort has been made by the EI to assure the accuracy and reliability of its contents, the **EI MAKES NO GUARANTEE THAT THE INFORMATION HEREIN IS COMPLETE OR ERROR-FREE. ANY PERSON OR ENTITY MAKING ANY USE OF THE INFORMATION HEREIN DOES SO AT HIS/HER/ITS OWN RISK. TO THE MAXIMUM EXTENT PERMITTED BY APPLICABLE LAW, THE INFORMATION HEREIN IS PROVIDED WITHOUT, AND THE EI HEREBY EXPRESSLY DISCLAIMS, ANY REPRESENTATION OR WARRANTY OF ANY KIND, WHETHER EXPRESS, IMPLIED OR STATUTORY, INCLUDING, WITHOUT LIMITATION, WARRANTIES OF MERCHANTABILITY, FITNESS FOR A PARTICULAR PURPOSE, TITLE AND NON-INFRINGEMENT. IN NO EVENT SHALL THE EI BE LIABLE TO ANY PERSON, OR ENTITY USING OR RECEIVING THE INFORMATION HEREIN FOR ANY CONSEQUENTIAL, INCIDENTAL, PUNITIVE, INDIRECT OR SPECIAL DAMAGES (INCLUDING, WITHOUT LIMITATION, LOST PROFITS), REGARDLESS OF THE BASIS OF SUCH LIABILITY, AND REGARDLESS OF WHETHER OR NOT THE EI HAS BEEN ADVISED OF THE POSSIBILITY OF SUCH DAMAGES OR IF SUCH DAMAGES COULD HAVE BEEN FORESEEN.**

The contents of this publication are not intended or designed to define or create legal rights or obligations, or set a legal standard of care.

The EI is not undertaking to meet the duties of manufacturers, purchasers, users and/or employers to warn and equip their employees and others concerning safety risks and precautions, nor is the EI undertaking any of the duties of manufacturers, purchasers, users and/or employers under local and regional laws and regulations. This information should not be used without first securing competent advice with respect to its suitability for any general or specific application, and all entities have an independent obligation to ascertain that their actions and practices are appropriate and suitable for each particular situation and to consult all applicable federal, state and local laws.

THE EI HEREBY EXPRESSLY DISCLAIMS ANY LIABILITY OR RESPONSIBILITY FOR LOSS OR DAMAGE RESULTING FROM THE VIOLATION OF ANY LOCAL OR REGIONAL LAWS OR REGULATIONS WITH WHICH THIS PUBLICATION MAY CONFLICT.

Nothing contained in any the EI publication is to be construed as granting any right, by implication or otherwise, for the manufacture, sale, or use of any method, apparatus, or product covered by letters patent. Neither should anything contained in the publication be construed as insuring anyone against liability for infringement of letters patent.

No reference made in this publication to any specific product or service constitutes or implies an endorsement, recommendation, or warranty thereof by the EI.

THE EI, AND ITS AFFILIATES, REPRESENTATIVES, CONSULTANTS, AND CONTRACTORS AND THEIR RESPECTIVE PARENTS, SUBSIDIARIES, AFFILIATES, CONSULTANTS, OFFICERS, DIRECTORS, EMPLOYEES, REPRESENTATIVES, AND MEMBERS SHALL HAVE NO LIABILITY WHATSOEVER FOR, AND SHALL BE HELD HARMLESS AGAINST, ANY LIABILITY FOR ANY INJURIES, LOSSES OR DAMAGES OF ANY KIND, INCLUDING DIRECT, INDIRECT, INCIDENTAL, CONSEQUENTIAL, OR PUNITIVE DAMAGES, TO PERSONS, INCLUDING PERSONAL INJURY OR DEATH, OR PROPERTY RESULTING IN WHOLE OR IN PART, DIRECTLY OR INDIRECTLY, FROM ACCEPTANCE, USE OR COMPLIANCE WITH THIS PUBLICATION.

FOREWORD

This report has been prepared from text and data provided by P. Rugen and J. Dunbar (Shell Global Solutions) and K. Petersen (Southwest Research Institute [SwRI]) under contract to the EI. These data, and a draft version of this report, were reviewed by members of the EI Aviation Committee.

The report documents work undertaken to assess whether simple electronic probes could detect bulk water in jet fuel during aircraft fuelling and provide a 'go, no-go' response. This work offers an alternative approach to fuel condition monitoring to that previously investigated by the EI that involved the quantification of particulate matter and/or free water. For further information on that approach see EI 1570 *Handbook on electronic sensors for the detection of particulate matter and/or free water during aircraft refuelling* and EI 1598 *Design, functional requirements and laboratory testing protocols for electronic sensors to monitor free water and/or particulate matter in aviation fuel*, 2nd edition.

The information contained in this report will be used to develop a new EI specification for electronic bulk water detectors, enabling minimum requirements for future models to be communicated between manufacturers and users, and to provide a consistent approach to their laboratory test rig assessment.

The EI is not undertaking to meet the duties of employers to warn and equip their employees, and others exposed, concerning health and safety risks and precautions, nor undertaking their obligations under local and regional laws and regulations.

Nothing contained in any EI publication is to be construed as granting any right, by implication or otherwise, for the manufacture, sale, or use of any method, apparatus, or product covered by letters patent. Neither shall anything contained in the publication be construed as insuring anyone against liability for infringement of letters patent.

This publication is intended to assist those involved in aircraft fuelling. Every effort has been made by the EI to ensure the accuracy and reliability of the data contained herein; however, the EI makes no representation, warranty, or guarantee in connection with this publication and hereby expressly disclaim any liability or responsibility for loss or damage resulting from its use or for the violation of any local or regional laws or regulations with which this publication may conflict.